Social and Environmental Issues in Community Forestry in Myanmar and Experiences in Applying Safeguards

Paing Htet Thu
Programme Officer
Myanmar Environment Rehabilitation-conservation Network (MERN)
Outline of presentation

OVERVIEW OF CF

SOCIAL AND ENVIRONMENTAL ISSUES OF CF

EXPERIENCE IN SAFEGUARDS
Objective of CF Establishment

- To fulfil the local need of fuelwood, pole, post and timber
- Improve socio-economic well-being through open-up job opportunities in the village
- To contribute the benefit to the village developments (Education, Health and Social)
- To protect from forest degradation and deforestation
- To share the benefit from forest management
Overview of Management Plan

1. Forest Plantation Establishment Plan
2. Natural Forest or Existing Forest Conservation Plan
3. Annual Workplan for Forest Plantation (Annex 1)
4. Annual Workplan for Natural Forest Conservation (Annex 2)
5. Annual Rainfall in Township for 10 yrs (Annex 3)
6. Location Map of CF (Annex 4)
7. Stock Map of CF (Annex 5)
8. Management Map (Annex 6)
1. Forest Plantation Establishment Plan

2. Natural Forest Conservation Plan
1. Forest Plantation Establishment Plan

1) Introduction
2) Objective
3) Location and Area
4) Climate (Temperature & Rainfall)
5) Topography
6) Soil Type
7) Conditions of Vegetation - Current status of forest (degraded forests)
8) Cultural Operation - Nursery establishment (detailed workplan), Site preparation, Planting, Weeding, Fire Protection, Silvicultural Operation, Rotation, Felling,
9) Distribution of forest products and
10) Conclusion
2. Natural Forest or Existing Forest Conservation Plan

1) Introduction
2) Tending before the rest period
3) Forest establishment in remuneration area
4) Cultural operation (Silvicultural Measures) - Regenerated Improved Felling, Weeding, Pruning and Coppicing
5) Distribution of Forest Products (inc; benefit sharing)
6) Conclusion
Stock Map
Management Map
Benefit Sharing

- (A) Rule and Regulation
- (B) Duties and Responsibilities
- (C) Penalty and Offence
- (D) Financial Management
## Benefit Sharing

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Sharing (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>For conservation purpose (reforestation &amp; restoration)</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Honorarium allowance for committee member</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>For members (CFUGs)</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Saving</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Other expenses</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Social and Environmental Issues in Community Forestry in Myanmar
“In your experience of managing CF to be sustained, what are the socio-economic and environmental issues and challenges: what kind of benefits or risks are there, and what kind of measures did you use to promote or reduce these?”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>By Certified CFs</th>
<th>Benefits</th>
<th>Measure to enhance</th>
<th>Risks/ Issues/ Challenges</th>
<th>Measure to reduce</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Socio-economic</td>
<td>Subsistence crab-farming (e.g., crab trapping) is allowed for the CFUGs in accordance with rule and regulation</td>
<td>Strengthen the coordination with relevant institutions (i.e., NGOs/INGOs) to receive supports (i.e., establishment of community revolving fund) to boost the existing conservation activities and promote livelihood options</td>
<td>Frequent encroachment into CF area doing aquaculture farming and cutting trees for firewood (sometime outsiders, and sometime non-CFUGs members from village)</td>
<td>Had an experience of solving encroachment issue together with FD and Fishery department</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Organize CFUGs to hold monthly and annual meeting to be able to strengthen coordination and cooperation between CFUGs</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Environment      | Crabs, shrimp, and fish are becoming abundant in CF | Hold regular meeting to strengthen coordination and cooperation between CFUGs  
• Regular patrolling  
• Regular monitoring by Committee members | Frequent encroachment into CF area doing aquaculture farming and cutting trees for firewood (sometime outsiders, and sometime non-CFUGs members from village) | Install noticeboards  
Raise awareness to CFUGs and to those who encroach into CF areas  
Organize CFUGs to hold monthly and annual meeting to be able to strengthen coordination and cooperation between CFUGs  
Patrolling, fire protection, restoration, and conservation |
“In your experience of managing CF to be sustained, what are the socio-economic and environmental issues and challenges: what kind of benefits or risks are there, and what kind of measures did you use to promote or reduce these?”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>By CFE</th>
<th>Benefits</th>
<th>Measure to enhance</th>
<th>Risks/ Issues/ Challenges</th>
<th>Measure to reduce</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Social | • Sharing knowledge and experience within groups  
• Having active participation  
• Having skill to manage business  
• Good coordination with governments departments | • Holding awareness raising events, exchange visits programme and capacity building training | • Financial (e.g., initial capital/start-up fund)  
• Technology (e.g., value chain or value-added product)  
• Law enforcement  
• Limited livelihood option | • Build capacity to stakeholder  
• Support alternative livelihood options  
• Mobilize community to have active participation |
| Economical | • Promoting CF based business (e.g., Mangrove Friendly Aquaculture) to secure the livelihoods | • Installing noticeboards, producing awareness pamphlets, and raising awareness through social media platform (e.g., Facebook) | • Limited access to technical and financial support effects to the product quality | • Detailed activity should be included in CFE business plan  
• Strengthen coordination with relevant institutions |
| Environmental | • Rich in biodiversity  
• Prevent from flooding  
• Mitigate climate change and having good weather condition | • Mangrove restoration and conservation | • Limited access to technical and financial support hinders the restoration and conservation activities | • Strengthen coordination with relevant institutions to receive support for conservation |
Experiences in applying Safeguards
Experiences in applying safeguards

- Support to development of Community Forest-based Enterprises in Mon State and Tanintaryi Region Project
- Establishment of demonstrating models of Community Forests (CFs) and Community Forest-based Enterprises (CFEs)

Selected three Safeguard Checklists
- 3.1 Stakeholder Participation and Coordination
- 3.2 Benefit Sharing
- 5.1 Natural Forest, Biodiversity and Ecosystem Services
## Generic CF Management Plan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Generic CFMP</th>
<th>Safeguard checklist</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Section (A) Background</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1 Introduction</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>2 Objectives</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>3 Name, Location and Area</td>
<td>2.1.1(6), 2.1.3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>4 Climate Condition</td>
<td>5.1.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>5 Topographic Condition</td>
<td>2.1.1.6(5.1.2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>6 Soil Type</td>
<td>2.1.1.6(5.1.2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Section (B) Forest Operations</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>7 Socio-economic Condition</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(a) Occupation and Land ownership of the members</td>
<td>2.1.5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(b) Best income-generation activities of members</td>
<td>2.1.2.5), 3.2.1(2i 3i 5i 6)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(c) Potential mangrove-friendly business for better income</td>
<td>2.1.2.5, 3.2.1(2i 3i 5i 6),</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>8 Environmental Condition</td>
<td>5.1.1-10)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(a) Mangrove species distribution and coverage</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(b) Wild animals</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(c) Bird species</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(d) Aquatic animals</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(e) Rare Species</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(f) Non-timber forest products</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Section (C) Management</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>9 Mangroves Rehabilitation and Conservation</td>
<td>5.1.1-10)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>10 Extraction of Timber and Non-timber Forest Products</td>
<td>5.1.1-10), 2.1.8-9), 2.1.2.1), 3.1.7), 3.2.1-6), 7.1.7i 1i 5i 6i 11i 13)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(a) Extraction and Utilizing of forest products for local use</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(b) Community Forest-Based Enterprise (CFE)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(1) Extracting forest products for economic purposes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(2) Extracting Non-timber forest products for economic purposes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>11 Rules and Regulations</td>
<td>3.1.1.1-9), 3.1.2. 1-4), 2.1.1.1i 2i 3i 5i 7i 8i 9i 10)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>12 Financial Management</td>
<td>2.1.2. 2.3.4), 3.2.4), 5.1.6), 7.1.2i 3i 5i 6i 7i 10i 11i 13)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>13 Supervising, Reporting and Information Sharing</td>
<td>2.1.1.9), 3.1.1.6i 7i 8i 9), 7.1.9i 10i 11i 13)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>14 Conclusion</td>
<td>2.1.1.2), 2.1.2.3i 4i 5i 8), 7.1.4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>15 General</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Appendix</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Introductory Training on REDD+ Safeguards to CFUGs
Discussion outputs of training

Checklist 3.1: Benefit Sharing was discussed by CF and CFE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Addressed</th>
<th>Respected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Benefit sharing is already described in CF’s management plan and CFE’s business plan. However, it only considers the benefits of CFUGs and less consideration on non-members (other communities). It should be updated in the coming CFUGs’ meeting. | #The information regard with CF implementation process will be shared among CFUGs in a transparent manner.  
#The rules and regulations of CF will be reviewed and revised accordingly, and it will be enforced with taking action.  
#Non-members will be provided the right to trap the crabs in CFs in order to mitigate the conflict and to ensure the distribution of benefits from CF. For example, 3 acres will be allocated for non-members from the total 10 acres of CF, equivalent to 30%.  
#The information of benefit sharing will be documented both members and non-members, and in terms of both monetary and non-monetary benefits.  
#Three reports are already submitted to the Forest Department by Warkone CF. In these reports, the lists of contributions for local development are included.  
#The committee and structure of Lay-kyaw CF will be reformed during this year (2023). |

Challenges in implementation of CFs and CFEs

#Wild pigs, birds, otter, lizard species are under threat due to illegal harvesting of forest products and encroachment of aquaculture to CF areas.  
#There is a policy conflict between fishery and forest department, and it hinders the development of CFE.  
#Weak coordination between CFs and relevant agencies  
#CF committee members are not fully aware of CF management plan.
Findings

Checklist 3.1: Stakeholder participation and coordination mechanisms

4. Where direct participation from all stakeholders is not possible, have stakeholder representatives with relevant knowledge and skills been chosen, based on equal and proportionate representation?

5. Have measures been specifically planned/put in place to support the participation of women, indigenous peoples/ethnic groups, youth and other marginalised groups?
   ▪ Which groups of stakeholders with low capacity, limited opportunities or barriers to participate have been identified? List them here.

Checklist 3.2: Benefit sharing

▪ Has the benefit sharing mechanism and its expected operation been fully documented and communicated to stakeholders?
Checklist 5.1: Natural forests, biodiversity and ecosystem services

3. Has the assessment and planning for the REDD+ action/s considered risks related to the conversion, loss or damage to natural forests and/or other natural ecosystems, and how to reduce these risks?
   ▪ Has an EIA / IEE been completed for the REDD+ action/s, if required under Myanmar regulations?
   ▪ Have measures to reduce risks to natural forests and/or other natural ecosystems been identified and incorporated into plans for the REDD+ action/s?

6. Does the M&E framework for the REDD+ action include indicators/monitoring of:
   - impacts on natural forests?
   - impacts on other natural ecosystems, if relevant?
   - impacts on biodiversity and ecosystem services?
   - Incentives for conservation?

8. Have there been any incidences of loss/damage of natural forest or other natural ecosystems attributable to the REDD+ action?

10. Is there documented evidence that the REDD+ action/s are contributing to the conservation and/or enhancement of biodiversity and ecosystem services?
    ▪ Number of received and number of resolved grievances related to natural forests, biodiversity and/or ecosystem services as a consequence of the REDD+ action
Formation of CF - the process follows FPIC, but they are not aware of FPIC in theory.

Conservation of Forest and Biodiversity - is one of the main objectives of CF Management Plan, but there is no mention of ecosystem services.

Benefit sharing - the sharing has already been allocated in percentage and areas, but it has not been implemented yet because CF has not generated the expected benefits.

Most CFUGs have never heard about the national REDD+ strategy and approach before, and this is their first-time hearing about REDD+ and its safeguards.

Build the background knowledge of the national REDD+ process, strategy, and approach in simple local language because REDD+ itself is very technical and complex for the local community to understand in a short time.

Importantly, the implementation of REDD+ and its safeguards should take time to ensure a smooth transition from application to practice. It is advised not to rush through the process.
Voices of Community

Member of Community Forest User Group

- After completing safeguards training, we understood some important factors. We thought that we were doing good things (conservation) and believed that it could only generate benefits, but we were unaware of the unexpected negative impacts on others. For example, protecting our community forest and crab fattening areas with nets created a barrier for those who collected fuelwood and trapped crabs for subsistence use, mostly casual laborers. Due to this action, in some cases, they destroyed or cut down our mangrove trees and crab fattening ponds.
Thank you!

Paing Htet Thu
Programme Officer
Myanmar Environment Rehabilitation-conservation Network (MERN)